

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

WENDY WINSLOW, an Individual,

Plaintiff,

v.

TARGET CORPORATION,  
VELOCITY PHARMA LLC,  
KILITCH HEALTHCARE INDIA  
LIMITED, and DOES 1-20, inclusive,

Defendants.

Case No.: 8:24-cv-02300-JWH-JDE

STIPULATED PROTECTIVE  
ORDER

Based on the parties' Stipulation and for good cause shown, the Court finds and orders as follows.

1. PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS

Discovery in this action is likely to involve production of confidential, proprietary or private information for which special protection from public disclosure and from use for any purpose other than pursuing this litigation may be warranted. Accordingly, the parties hereby stipulate to and petition the Court to enter the following Stipulated Protective Order. The parties acknowledge that this Order does not confer blanket protections on all disclosures or responses to discovery and that the protection it affords from public disclosure and use extends

1 only to the limited information or items that are entitled to confidential treatment  
2 under the applicable legal principles.

3 2. GOOD CAUSE STATEMENT

4 This action is likely to involve trade secrets, commercial, financial, technical,  
5 personal health and/or proprietary information for which special protection from  
6 public disclosure and from use for any purpose other than prosecution of this action  
7 is warranted. Such confidential and proprietary materials and information consist of,  
8 among other things, confidential business or financial information, information  
9 regarding confidential business practices, or other confidential research,  
10 development, personal health or commercial information (including information  
11 implicating privacy rights of third parties), information otherwise generally  
12 unavailable to the public, or which may be privileged or otherwise protected from  
13 disclosure under state or federal statutes, court rules, case decisions, or common  
14 law. Accordingly, to expedite the flow of information, to facilitate the prompt  
15 resolution of disputes over confidentiality of discovery materials, to adequately  
16 protect information the parties are entitled to keep confidential, to ensure that the  
17 parties are permitted reasonable necessary uses of such material in preparation for  
18 and in the conduct of trial, to address their handling at the end of the litigation, and  
19 serve the ends of justice, a protective order for such information is justified in this  
20 matter. It is the intent of the parties that information will not be designated as  
21 confidential for tactical reasons and that nothing be so designated without a good  
22 faith belief that it has been maintained in a confidential, non-public manner, and  
23 there is good cause why it should not be part of the public record of this case.

24 3. ACKNOWLEDGMENT OF UNDER SEAL FILING PROCEDURE

25 The parties further acknowledge, as set forth in Section 14.3, below, that this  
26 Stipulated Protective Order does not entitle them to file confidential information  
27 under seal; Local Civil Rule 79-5 sets forth the procedures that must be followed  
28 and the standards that will be applied when a party seeks permission from the court

1 to file material under seal. There is a strong presumption that the public has a right  
2 of access to judicial proceedings and records in civil cases. In connection with non-  
3 dispositive motions, good cause must be shown to support a filing under seal. See  
4 Kamakana v. City and County of Honolulu, 447 F.3d 1172, 1176 (9th Cir. 2006),  
5 Phillips v. Gen. Motors Corp., 307 F.3d 1206, 1210-11 (9th Cir. 2002), Makar-  
6 Welbon v. Sony Electronics, Inc., 187 F.R.D. 576, 577 (E.D. Wis. 1999) (even  
7 stipulated protective orders require good cause showing), and a specific showing of  
8 good cause or compelling reasons with proper evidentiary support and legal  
9 justification, must be made with respect to Protected Material that a party seeks to  
10 file under seal. The parties' mere designation of Disclosure or Discovery Material as  
11 CONFIDENTIAL does not— without the submission of competent evidence by  
12 declaration, establishing that the material sought to be filed under seal qualifies as  
13 confidential, privileged, or otherwise protectable—constitute good cause.

14 Further, if a party requests sealing related to a dispositive motion or trial, then  
15 compelling reasons, not only good cause, for the sealing must be shown, and the  
16 relief sought shall be narrowly tailored to serve the specific interest to be protected.  
17 See Pintos v. Pacific Creditors Ass'n., 605 F.3d 665, 677-79 (9th Cir. 2010). For  
18 each item or type of information, document, or thing sought to be filed or introduced  
19 under seal, the party seeking protection must articulate compelling reasons,  
20 supported by specific facts and legal justification, for the requested sealing order.  
21 Again, competent evidence supporting the application to file documents under seal  
22 must be provided by declaration.

23 Any document that is not confidential, privileged, or otherwise protectable in its  
24 entirety will not be filed under seal if the confidential portions can be redacted. If  
25 documents can be redacted, then a redacted version for public viewing, omitting  
26 only the confidential, privileged, or otherwise protectable portions of the document,  
27 shall be filed. Any application that seeks to file documents under seal in their  
28 entirety should include an explanation of why redaction is not feasible.

1           4.     DEFINITIONS

2           4.1     Action: this pending federal lawsuit, *WENDY WINSLOW v. TARGET*  
3     *CORPORATION, ET AL.*

4           4.2     Challenging Party: a Party or Non-Party that challenges the  
5     designation of information or items under this Order.

6           4.3     “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items: information (regardless of  
7     how it is generated, stored or maintained) or tangible things that qualify for  
8     protection under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(c), and as specified above in  
9     the Good Cause Statement.

10          4.4     Counsel: Outside Counsel of Record and House Counsel (as well as  
11     their support staff).

12          4.5     Designating Party: a Party or Non-Party that designates information or  
13     items that it produces in disclosures or in responses to discovery as  
14     “CONFIDENTIAL.”

15          4.6     Disclosure or Discovery Material: all items or information, regardless  
16     of the medium or manner in which it is generated, stored, or maintained (including,  
17     among other things, testimony, transcripts, and tangible things), that are produced or  
18     generated in disclosures or responses to discovery.

19          4.7     Expert: a person with specialized knowledge or experience in a matter  
20     pertinent to the litigation who has been retained by a Party or its counsel to serve as  
21     an expert witness or as a consultant in this Action.

22          4.8     House Counsel: attorneys who are employees of a party to this Action.  
23     House Counsel does not include Outside Counsel of Record or any other outside  
24     counsel.

25          4.9     Non-Party: any natural person, partnership, corporation, association or  
26     other legal entity not named as a Party to this action.

27          4.10    Outside Counsel of Record: attorneys who are not employees of a party  
28     to this Action but are retained to represent a party to this Action and have appeared

1 in this Action on behalf of that party or are affiliated with a law firm that has  
2 appeared on behalf of that party, and includes support staff.

3 4.11 Party: any party to this Action, including all of its officers, directors,  
4 employees, consultants, retained experts, and Outside Counsel of Record (and their  
5 support staffs).

6 4.12 Producing Party: a Party or Non-Party that produces Disclosure or  
7 Discovery Material in this Action.

8 4.13 Professional Vendors: persons or entities that provide litigation support  
9 services (e.g., photocopying, videotaping, translating, preparing exhibits or  
10 demonstrations, and organizing, storing, or retrieving data in any form or medium)  
11 and their employees and subcontractors.

12 4.14 Protected Material: any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is  
13 designated as "CONFIDENTIAL."

14 4.15 Receiving Party: a Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery  
15 Material from a Producing Party.

16 5. SCOPE

17 The protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order cover not only  
18 Protected Material (as defined above), but also (1) any information copied or  
19 extracted from Protected Material; (2) all copies, excerpts, summaries, or  
20 compilations of Protected Material; and (3) any testimony, conversations, or  
21 presentations by Parties or their Counsel that might reveal Protected Material.

22 Any use of Protected Material at trial shall be governed by the orders of the  
23 trial judge and other applicable authorities. This Order does not govern the use of  
24 Protected Material at trial.

25 6. DURATION

26 Once a case proceeds to trial, information that was designated as  
27 CONFIDENTIAL or maintained pursuant to this protective order used or introduced  
28 as an exhibit at trial becomes public and will be presumptively available to all

1 members of the public, including the press, unless compelling reasons supported by  
2 specific factual findings to proceed otherwise are made to the trial judge in advance  
3 of the trial. See Kamakana, 447 F.3d at 1180-81 (distinguishing “good cause”  
4 showing for sealing documents produced in discovery from “compelling reasons”  
5 standard when merits-related documents are part of court record). Accordingly, the  
6 terms of this protective order do not extend beyond the commencement of the trial.

7 7. DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL

8 7.1 Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for  
9 Protection. Each Party or Non-Party that designates information or  
10 items for protection under this Order must take care to limit any such designation to  
11 specific material that qualifies under the appropriate standards. The Designating  
12 Party must designate for protection only those parts of material, documents, items or  
13 oral or written communications that qualify so that other portions of the material,  
14 documents, items or communications for which protection is not warranted are not  
15 swept unjustifiably within the ambit of this Order.

16 Mass, indiscriminate or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations  
17 that are shown to be clearly unjustified or that have been made for an improper  
18 purpose (e.g., to unnecessarily encumber the case development process or to impose  
19 unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may expose the Designating  
20 Party to sanctions.

21 If it comes to a Designating Party’s attention that information or items that it  
22 designated for protection do not qualify for protection, that Designating Party must  
23 promptly notify all other Parties that it is withdrawing the inapplicable designation.

24 7.2 Manner and Timing of Designations. Except as otherwise provided in  
25 this Order, or as otherwise stipulated or ordered, Disclosure of Discovery Material  
26 that qualifies for protection under this Order must be clearly so designated before  
27 the material is disclosed or produced.

28 Designation in conformity with this Order requires:

1 (a) for information in documentary form (e.g., paper or electronic  
2 documents, but excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial  
3 proceedings), that the Producing Party affix at a minimum, the legend  
4 “CONFIDENTIAL” (hereinafter “CONFIDENTIAL legend”), to each page that  
5 contains protected material. If only a portion of the material on a page qualifies for  
6 protection, the Producing Party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s)  
7 (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the margins).

8 A Party or Non-Party that makes original documents available for inspection  
9 need not designate them for protection until after the inspecting Party has indicated  
10 which documents it would like copied and produced. During the inspection and  
11 before the designation, all of the material made available for inspection shall be  
12 deemed “CONFIDENTIAL.” After the inspecting Party has identified the  
13 documents it wants copied and produced, the Producing Party must determine which  
14 documents, or portions thereof, qualify for protection under this Order. Then, before  
15 producing the specified documents, the Producing Party must affix the  
16 “CONFIDENTIAL legend” to each page that contains Protected Material. If only a  
17 portion of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also  
18 must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings  
19 in the margins).

20 (b) for testimony given in depositions that the Designating Party  
21 identifies the Disclosure or Discovery Material on the record, before the close of the  
22 deposition all protected testimony.

23 (c) for information produced in some form other than documentary and  
24 for any other tangible items, that the Producing Party affix in a prominent place on  
25 the exterior of the container or containers in which the information is stored the  
26 legend “CONFIDENTIAL.” If only a portion or portions of the information  
27 warrants protection, the Producing Party, to the extent practicable, shall identify the  
28 protected portion(s).

1           7.3 Inadvertent Failures to Designate. If timely corrected, an inadvertent  
2 failure to designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive  
3 the Designating Party's right to secure protection under this Order for such material.  
4 Upon timely correction of a designation, the Receiving Party must make reasonable  
5 efforts to assure that the material is treated in accordance with the provisions of this  
6 Order.

7           8. CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS

8           8.1. Timing of Challenges. Any Party or Non-Party may challenge a  
9 designation of confidentiality at any time that is consistent with the Court's  
10 Scheduling Order.

11          8.2 Meet and Confer. The Challenging Party shall initiate the dispute  
12 resolution process under Local Rule 37-1 et seq.

13          8.3 Joint Stipulation. Any challenge submitted to the Court shall be via a joint  
14 stipulation pursuant to Local Rule 37-2.

15          8.4 The burden of persuasion in any such challenge proceeding shall be on the  
16 Designating Party. Frivolous challenges, and those made for an improper purpose  
17 (e.g., to harass or impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may  
18 expose the Challenging Party to sanctions. Unless the Designating Party has waived  
19 or withdrawn the confidentiality designation, all parties shall continue to afford the  
20 material in question the level of protection to which it is entitled under the  
21 Producing Party's designation until the Court rules on the challenge.

22          9. ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

23          9.1 Basic Principles. A Receiving Party may use Protected Material that is  
24 disclosed or produced by another Party or by a Non-Party in connection with this  
25 Action only for prosecuting, defending or attempting to settle this Action. Such  
26 Protected Material may be disclosed only to the categories of persons and under the  
27 conditions described in this Order. Upon termination of the Action, a Receiving  
28 Party must comply with section 15 below (FINAL DISPOSITION).



1 Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party at a  
2 location and in a secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons  
3 authorized under this Order.

4 9.2 Disclosure of “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items. Unless  
5 otherwise ordered by the court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a  
6 Receiving Party may disclose any information or item designated  
7 “CONFIDENTIAL” only to:

8 (a) the Receiving Party’s Outside Counsel of Record in this Action, as  
9 well as employees of said Outside Counsel of Record to whom it is reasonably  
10 necessary to disclose the information for this Action;

11 (b) the officers, directors, and employees (including House Counsel) of  
12 the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action;

13 (c) Experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to whom  
14 disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have signed the  
15 “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

16 (d) the court and its personnel;

17 (e) court reporters and their staff;

18 (f) professional jury or trial consultants, mock jurors, and Professional  
19 Vendors to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have  
20 signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

21 (g) the author or recipient of a document containing the information or  
22 a custodian or other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information;

23 (h) during their depositions, witnesses, and attorneys for witnesses, in  
24 the Action to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary provided: (1) the deposing  
25 party requests that the witness sign the form attached as Exhibit A hereto; and (2)  
26 they will not be permitted to keep any confidential information unless they sign the  
27 “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A), unless otherwise  
28 agreed by the Designating Party or ordered by the court. Pages of transcribed

1 deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal Protected Material may  
2 be separately bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to anyone except  
3 as permitted under this Stipulated Protective Order; and

4 (i) any mediators or settlement officers and their supporting personnel,  
5 mutually agreed upon by any of the parties engaged in settlement discussions.

6 10. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED  
7 PRODUCED IN OTHER LITIGATION

8 If a Party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation  
9 that compels disclosure of any information or items designated in this Action as  
10 “CONFIDENTIAL,” that Party must:

11 (a) promptly notify in writing the Designating Party. Such notification  
12 shall include a copy of the subpoena or court order;

13 (b) promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or  
14 order to issue in the other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the  
15 subpoena or order is subject to this Protective Order. Such notification shall include  
16 a copy of this Stipulated Protective Order; and

17 (c) cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be  
18 pursued by the Designating Party whose Protected Material may be affected. If the  
19 Designating Party timely seeks a protective order, the Party served with the  
20 subpoena or court order shall not produce any information designated in this action  
21 as “CONFIDENTIAL” before a determination by the court from which the  
22 subpoena or order issued, unless the Party has obtained the Designating Party’s  
23 permission. The Designating Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking  
24 protection in that court of its confidential material and nothing in these provisions  
25 should be construed as authorizing or encouraging a Receiving Party in this Action  
26 to disobey a lawful directive from another court.

27 ///

28 ///

11. A NON-PARTY'S PROTECTED MATERIAL SOUGHT TO  
BE PRODUCED IN THIS LITIGATION

(a) The terms of this Order are applicable to information produced by a Non-Party in this Action and designated as "CONFIDENTIAL." Such information produced by Non-Parties in connection with this litigation is protected by the remedies and relief provided by this Order. Nothing in these provisions should be construed as prohibiting a Non-Party from seeking additional protections.

(b) In the event that a Party is required, by a valid discovery request, to produce a Non-Party's confidential information in its possession, and the Party is subject to an agreement with the Non-Party not to produce the Non-Party's confidential information, then the Party shall:

(1) promptly notify in writing the Requesting Party and the Non-Party that some or all of the information requested is subject to a confidentiality agreement with a Non-Party;

(2) promptly provide the Non-Party with a copy of the Stipulated Protective Order in this Action, the relevant discovery request(s), and a reasonably specific description of the information requested; and

(3) make the information requested available for inspection by the Non-Party, if requested.

(c) If the Non-Party fails to seek a protective order from this court within 14 days of receiving the notice and accompanying information, the Receiving Party may produce the Non-Party's confidential information responsive to the discovery request. If the Non-Party timely seeks a protective order, the Receiving Party shall not produce any information in its possession or control that is subject to the confidentiality agreement with the Non-Party before a determination by the court. Absent a court order to the contrary, the Non-Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking protection in this court of its Protected Material.

///

12. UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed Protected Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this Stipulated Protective Order, the Receiving Party must immediately (a) notify in writing the Designating Party of the unauthorized disclosures, (b) use its best efforts to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the Protected Material, (c) inform the person or persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the terms of this Order, and (d) request such person or persons to execute the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” attached hereto as Exhibit A.

13. INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE PROTECTED MATERIAL

When a Producing Party gives notice to Receiving Parties that certain inadvertently produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or other protection, the obligations of the Receiving Parties are those set forth in Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This provision is not intended to modify whatever procedure may be established in an e-discovery order that provides for production without prior privilege review. Pursuant to Federal Rule of Evidence 502(d) and (e), insofar as the parties reach an agreement on the effect of disclosure of a communication or information covered by the attorney-client privilege or work product protection, the parties may incorporate their agreement in the stipulated protective order submitted to the court.

14. MISCELLANEOUS

14.1 Right to Further Relief. Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any person to seek its modification by the Court in the future.

14.2 Right to Assert Other Objections. By stipulating to the entry of this Protective Order, no Party waives any right it otherwise would have to object to disclosing or producing any information or item on any ground not addressed in this Stipulated Protective Order. Similarly, no Party waives any right to object on any

1 ground to use in evidence of any of the material covered by this Protective Order.

2 14.3 Filing Protected Material. A Party that seeks to file under seal any  
3 Protected Material must comply with Local Civil Rule 79-5. Protected Material may  
4 only be filed under seal pursuant to a court order authorizing the sealing of the  
5 specific Protected Material. If a Party's request to file Protected Material under seal  
6 is denied by the court, then the Receiving Party may file the information in the  
7 public record unless otherwise instructed by the court.

8 15. FINAL DISPOSITION

9 After the final disposition of this Action, as defined in paragraph 6, within 60  
10 days of a written request by the Designating Party, each Receiving Party must return  
11 all Protected Material to the Producing Party or destroy such material. As used in  
12 this subdivision, "all Protected Material" includes all copies, abstracts, compilations,  
13 summaries, and any other format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected  
14 Material. Whether the Protected Material is returned or destroyed, the Receiving  
15 Party must submit a written certification to the Producing Party (and, if not the same  
16 person or entity, to the Designating Party) by the 60-day deadline that (1) identifies  
17 (by category, where appropriate) all the Protected Material that was returned or  
18 destroyed and (2) affirms that the Receiving Party has not retained any copies,  
19 abstracts, compilations, summaries or any other format reproducing or capturing any  
20 of the Protected Material. Notwithstanding this provision, Counsel are entitled to  
21 retain an archival copy of all pleadings, motion papers, trial, deposition, and hearing  
22 transcripts, legal memoranda, correspondence, deposition and trial exhibits, expert  
23 reports, attorney work product, and consultant and expert work product, even if such  
24 materials contain Protected Material. Any such archival copies that contain or  
25 constitute Protected Material remain subject to this Protective Order as set forth in  
26 Section 6 (DURATION).

27 16. VIOLATION

28 Any violation of this Order may be punished by appropriate measures

1 including, without limitation, contempt proceedings and/or monetary sanctions.

2  
3 FOR GOOD CAUSE SHOWN, IT IS SO ORDERED.

4  
5 DATED: \_\_\_\_\_ January 28, 2025 \_\_\_\_\_

6  
7   
8 JOHN D. EARLY  
9 United States Magistrate Judge  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

EXHIBIT A

ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND

I, \_\_\_\_\_, of \_\_\_\_\_  
[COPMANY NAME], \_\_\_\_\_ [ADDRESS], declare under  
penalty of perjury that I have read in its entirety and understand the Stipulated  
Protective Order that was issued by the United States District Court for the Central  
District of California on January 28, 2025, in the case of WENDY WINSLOW v.  
TARGET CORPORATION, et al, Case No.: 8:24-cv-02300-JWH-JDE. I agree to  
comply with and to be bound by all the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order and  
I understand and acknowledge that failure to so comply could expose me to  
sanctions and punishment in the nature of contempt. I solemnly promise that I will  
not disclose in any manner any information or item that is subject to this Stipulated  
Protective Order to any person or entity except in strict compliance with the  
provisions of this Order.

I further agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District Court  
for the Central District of California for enforcing the terms of this Stipulated  
Protective Order, even if such enforcement proceedings occur after termination of  
this action. I hereby appoint \_\_\_\_\_ [print or type full  
name] of \_\_\_\_\_ [print or type full address  
and telephone number] as my California agent for service of process in connection  
with this action or any proceedings related to enforcement of this Stipulated  
Protective Order.

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

City and State where sworn and signed: \_\_\_\_\_

Printed name: \_\_\_\_\_

Signature: \_\_\_\_\_